Study of Effective Factors on Customers Trust in Electronic Banking Services
(Case study: Melli Bank in Ardabil City)

Shahram Gilaninia (Corresponding Author)
Department of Industrial Management, Rasht Branch, Islamic Azad University, Rasht, Iran

Mohammad Taleghani
Department of Industrial Management, Rasht Branch, Islamic Azad University, Rasht, Iran

Taher Taheri
M.A. Student of Business Management, Rasht Branch, Islamic Azad University, Rasht, Iran

Seyyed Javad Mousavian
Department of Management, Astara Branch, Islamic Azad University, Astara, Iran

Abstract
Today banking industry is changing rapidly. With the development of international economy and competitive markets, also banks are affected; the main force in this environment is technological that case to break barrier of legal, geographic and industry and has create new products and services. Today’s many banks provide their services as electronic. The main objective of this study examine of effective factors on customer trust in electronic banking services in Melli bank of Iran (Ardabil city). Research method is descriptive survey. Statistical society of this study is include all of Melli banks branches Customers in Ardabil city that sample size is obtained 392 people. Measurement tool in this study is questionnaire that its reliability by using Cronbach's formula was obtained 0.98. Also statistical method is used the correlation coefficient test and multiple regression by enter method. Obtained results of the Pearson correlation test showed that independent variables of Perceived security, perceived usefulness, perceived Privacy Policy, customer satisfaction have high correlation with the dependent variable, customer’s trust in electronic banking services.

Keywords: Customer Trust, Electronic Banking, Customer Satisfaction, Perceived Usefulness

1- Introduction
Today’s banking industry is changing rapidly. With the development of international economy and competitive markets, banks are also affected. Technology is main force in this environment that is causing to disappear hindrances of industry, legal geography and have created new product and services (Liao Z, 2002, p 285). According to expanded effect of electronic commerce and its dominate on worlds markets, Also consider to the importance monetary and credit transactions in any commercial - economic activity can proposed electronic banking as an inseparable part from e-commerce and its role in its implementing (Rahmati, 2009). The banking industry in the world is growing and changing. With the development of information and communications technology into the homes and being accessible to all individuals and human societies, banks are also trying with other sectors of society with the new approach, rather than physical development implement to expand their virtual presence in the companies, firms and households. Bank customers by using electronic banking services can accomplish their banking operations in favorite’s time and place can accomplish and the banks from the lower operating costs will benefit due to reduced staff numbers and reducing the number of branches (Seyyed Javadin & Yazdani, 2005, p47). In general can be said electronic banking is include ability of employees to increase their speed and efficiency in providing banking services of branch location and process between the bank and branch around the world and provide hardware and software to customers that they can do your banking operations by using them without physical presence in banks, at any time of day via a secure and reliable communication channels (Rahmati, 2009).

Today, many banks around the world offer their services electronically; from first half of the 90th have growth annual 23 percent in the use of electronic data interchange and estimated has been developed 36 percent till 2000. Currently, the use of electronic payment instruments have prosper in the world and the growing use of machines (ATMs), telephone and internet banking is respectively 25, 26, 35. Iran in the field of electronic commerce and electronic banking in the world is ranked 58(Sarmadi, 2004, p18). Electronic banking services in a competitive market could follow the path towards the promotion and development. One of the most important tools to develop electronic banking is to attractive customers’ trust using services to this technology and their
satisfaction (Khaksar, Giahi, 2009). Consumer trust is one of the key factors and key elements of successful in electronic commerce. As far many experts, the key to success in e-business know creation and deployment of safe and reliable process for the buyer (Hoseini & et al, 2008). In the meantime issue of customer trust as an infrastructure of successful e-business has acceptance widely. As various researches, distrust is as one of the major barriers to developing e-commerce. Virtual trust is state of mind which person is vulnerable in buying and selling electronically (corbitt-Brianj, etal, 2003). Despite this sense the concept of customer trust in e-commerce and its dimensions and affective factors are ambiguity. in fact this research proceed to identify effective factors on customer trust in electronic banking services and in formulation of marketing strategies will help to designers and marketers that they be focused on these factors. Thus main question of research is:

Is there relationship between effective factors on customer trust and electronic banking service in Melli bank of Ardabil city?

2- Theoretical Framework

Electronic banking includes all electronic channels that customers use for access their accounts and pay bills or transfer money. These channels include: telephone, internet, mobile and digital TV (Gilaninia & et al, 2011; lu.jetal, 2003).

The modern banking system has got the attention of all the people in the world in the 1970s (Gilaninia& et al, 2011). In fact, we can say that an electronic banking phenomenon is considered of achievement electronic commerce and with growing electronic commerce in world and according to require of commerce to do banks operation as easy, fast and accurate, for funds transfer, thus electronic banking is essential in e-commerce. Electronic banking primarily is provided customers access to banking services through safe mediated and without the presence of physical (Kahzadi, 2001). As an application of the Internet, e-commerce depends on information infrastructures and telecommunications for its development. Specifically, Stewart et al.(2002) point to the broadband penetration rate as one of the factors best explaining the different levels of e-commerce adoption and development observed in developed countries such as the United States, Canada, United Kingdom, and Australia, where in any case the conventional Internet access infrastructure is widely available (Dutta,1997). Iran in the field of ecommerce and internet as result internet banking, ranking 58th in world (Gilaninia & et al,2011).

According to banks activation, competition development and communication and information development at international level, today absorption and maintenance of customers in the country banking industry has been complicated by many degrees that itself led to reduction of banks interest. Richard and Sesser, 1990, declared that a decrease of 5% in customer number will lead to banks loosing 50% of their profit. According to carried out studies, 5% increase in maintenance of current customers will increase company profit by 25 to 125% (Rezvani& et al, 2011; Beerli and et al, 2007).

Table 1: Some of conducted Research in the field of electronic banking

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scholar</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Research results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tan&amp;Teo,2000</td>
<td>Factor influencing the adoption of internet banking</td>
<td>The result showed that the factors from perceived behavioral control and attitude most impact of social factors play a significant role in influencing intention to adopt internet banking services. The findings of this study argue that Intention to adopt internet banking services can be predicted by perceptions from control behavior and attitudes and subjective norms don’t have played a role.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alagheband,2006</td>
<td>Adoption of electronic banking services by Iranian customers</td>
<td>Analysis results showed that perceptions from relative advantage, compatibility, can try the service, cost and risk as well as gender and social character have effect on the acceptance electronic services.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rugimbana,R,(2007)</td>
<td>The relationship between values and personal e-banking service preferences</td>
<td>Outstanding cultural values such as character pressure of reference group, self-esteem and social identity have a significant impact in probability of acceptance of electronic banking channels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hoseini &amp; ghaderi(2010)</td>
<td>model of factors affecting on the quality of banking services</td>
<td>Found that the amazing development of information and communication technology and use information technology and information networks has also influenced the banking industry. Informatics industry developed rapid is caused major changes in form of money and resources transfer systems in field of banking and have offer new concepts of electronic money and transfer electronic. In other hand banks proceed to innovation in services active and Continuously.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Laukkanen (2007) compared customer value perceptions of Internet versus mobile banking. The increased interest in electronic banking channels has led business managers to consider measures to increase the acceptance of these channels by customers.

According to the expressed content, the model of the present study has been selected from research by Noorani Kotenaei and Alizadeh Sani.

| Laukkanen (2007) | Internet VS mobile banking: comparing customer value perceptions | Increased business managers about the perceived value of electronic banking channels for measures to increase the acceptance by customers of banking channels. |

Perceived security


Perceived usefulness:

Perceived usefulness is defined by Davis as "the degree to which a person believes that using a particular system would enhance his or her job performance" (Davis, 1989, p. 320). The importance of perceived usefulness has been widely recognized in the field of electronic banking (Gilaninia & et al, 2011; Guriting and Ndubisi, 2006; Jaruwachirathanakul and Fink, 2005; Eriksson et al., 2005; Laforet and Li, 2005; Polatoglu and Ekin, 2001; Liao and Cheung, 2002).

Perceived privacy

Privacy has long been defined as the right of a person to be left alone and to be able to have control over the flow and disclosure of information about him or herself (S.D. Warren & et al, 1980). The Federal Trade Commission (FTC) has been evaluating the online marketplace and has identified privacy as a key issue that Internet marketers need to recognize and address (K.B. Sheehan, 2000).

Customer satisfaction

The emergence of customer satisfaction at financial institutions has been widely studied and focus on customer satisfaction is the primary goal of any organization, especially banks. Full understanding of this issue is important for researchers and officials (Taleghani & et al, 2011; Arbore, 2009) Customer satisfaction is defined as a customer’s overall evaluation of the performance of an offering to date (Gilaninia, 2011; Johnson and Fornell, 1991). Customer satisfaction is not an absolute scenario, but very much depends on interactions, feedback, praise, and complaints (Taleghani & et al, 2011).
3- Research Hypotheses

1- There is significant relationship between perceived security and Customer trust in electronic banking services.
2- There is significant relationship between Perceived usefulness and Customer trust in electronic banking services.
3- There is significant relationship between Perceived privacy and Customer trust in electronic banking services.
4- There is significant relationship between Customer satisfaction and Customer trust in electronic banking services.

4- Research Method

Research method is descriptive survey. Statistical society of this study is included all of Mellı banks branches Customers in Ardabil city. Ardabil Mellı Bank has 57 branches that there are 30 branches in the city of Ardabil. That sample size is obtained 392 people. This study is field research. Measurement tool in this study is questionnaire that its reliability by using Cronbach's formula was obtained 0.98. Also statistical method is used the correlation coefficient test and multiple regression by enter method.

5- Data Analysis

Table 2: Correlation coefficient between variables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Customer trust</th>
<th>Customer satisfaction</th>
<th>Perceived security</th>
<th>Perceived usefulness</th>
<th>Perceived privacy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Customer trust</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.981**</td>
<td>.901**</td>
<td>.877**</td>
<td>.953**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>392</td>
<td>392</td>
<td>392</td>
<td>392</td>
<td>392</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customer satisfaction</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.981**</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.906**</td>
<td>.909**</td>
<td>.958**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>392</td>
<td>392</td>
<td>392</td>
<td>392</td>
<td>392</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceived security</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.901**</td>
<td>.906**</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.913**</td>
<td>.910**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>392</td>
<td>392</td>
<td>392</td>
<td>392</td>
<td>392</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceived usefulness</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.877**</td>
<td>.909**</td>
<td>.913**</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.941**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>392</td>
<td>392</td>
<td>392</td>
<td>392</td>
<td>392</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceived privacy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.953**</td>
<td>.958**</td>
<td>.910**</td>
<td>.941**</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>392</td>
<td>392</td>
<td>392</td>
<td>392</td>
<td>392</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

First hypothesis:

Relationship between individual preferences and values of the electronic banking services that sig=0.000<0.05.thus this relationship is significant with 95% confidence. Also based on this table can be said that the intensity of variable correlation between perceptual security and customer trust is 90/1 percent and this indicates a direct relationship between two variables. On the other hand determine ratio between the two variables perceptual security and customers’ trust is 0/811 shows that the independent variable predict rate of 81/1 percent of a dependent variable.

Second hypothesis:

According to the results of statistical analysis concluded sig = / 000 / 05.thus this relationship is significant with 95% confidence. Also based on this table can be said that the intensity of variable correlation between Perceived usefulness and customer trust is 87/7 percent and this indicates a direct relationship between two variables. On the other hand determine ratio between the two variables Perceived usefulness and customers’ trust is 0/769 shows that the independent variable predict rate of 76/9 percent of a dependent variable.
Third hypothesis:
According to the results of statistical analysis concluded sig = / 000 / 05.thus this relationship is significant with 95% confidence. Also based on this table can be said that the intensity of variable correlation between Perceived privacy and customer trust is 95/3 percent and this indicates a direct relationship between two variables. On the other hand determine ratio between the two variables Perceived privacy and customers’ trust is 0/908 shows that the independent variable predict rate of 90/8 percent of a dependent variable.

Forth hypothesis:
According to the results of statistical analysis concluded sig = / 000 / 05.thus this relationship is significant with 95% confidence. Also based on this table can be said that the intensity of variable correlation between Customer satisfaction and customer trust is 98/1 percent and this indicates a direct relationship between two variables. On the other hand determine ratio between the two variables Customer satisfaction and customers’ trust is 0/962 shows that the independent variable predict rate of 96/2 percent of a dependent variable.

Table 3) Multi Regression between variables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Unstandardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Std. Error</td>
<td>Beta</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>.028</td>
<td>.038</td>
<td>.737</td>
<td>.462</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceived security</td>
<td>.125</td>
<td>.021</td>
<td>.137</td>
<td>5.871</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceived usefulness</td>
<td>-.275</td>
<td>.026</td>
<td>-.294</td>
<td>-10.677</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceived privacy</td>
<td>.316</td>
<td>.033</td>
<td>.352</td>
<td>9.572</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customer satisfaction</td>
<td>.835</td>
<td>.033</td>
<td>.786</td>
<td>25.473</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to amount F=3/413 and obtained signification level can said that there is signification relationship between Total of independent variables with the dependent variable (consumer trust). Standardized beta values show the importance of for each predictor in model. According to results obtained from regression and according to regression coefficient, customer satisfaction has most coefficient (/786), after changing customer satisfaction to respectively perceived privacy variables (/352), Perceived security (/137), Perceived usefulness (-/294) have the most to the least effect on customer trust. Means for every unit to improve customer satisfaction, perceived privacy, Perceived security, Perceived usefulness increase the amount of customers trust to electronic banking services And Conversely.

6- Conclusions and Suggestions
According to results of first hypothesis test is observed that Independent variables of conceptual security 81/1 % predicts a dependent variable. Therefore is suggested that Bank officials and decision makers should adopt strategies until when the client’s ongoing activities through internet banking or ATM is be sure of their account safety .to introduce exact address of reputable sites can help to customers trust to perform banking activities via the internet and also they should use from newest safety and security technology in banking services.

According to results of second hypothesis test is observed that independent variables of perceived usefulness 76 % predicts a dependent variable. Therefore is suggested that wide activities is conducted for to electronic introduce of banking and actual and potential customers who are not yet comprehensive information from electronic banking services shall be known through the media and the press and through brochures and newspapers towards benefits of electronic banking.

According to results of third hypothesis test is observed that independent variables of perceived privacy 90/8 % predicts a dependent variable. Therefore is suggested that further measures is performed in the field rate of keep accounts, believed to function correctly and accuracy electronic banking services and competent capability of electronic banking services through bank officials. For example banks in this field can via short message informing aware customer from status of their bills when changes customer account and in this field should telephone number for customers by bank during the day and night should be considered for dealing with complaints and the same number to customers will be notified via SMS.

Results of the fourth hypothesis test show that independent variable of Customer satisfaction has effect in predictors of customers trust in electronic banking services . Therefore is suggested that customers is encourage through Provide little advantage to get this banking services again and provide actions that is met customer expectations of banking services.
References


Khaksar, S; Giahi, I. (2009). Examining effective factors on customers trust to payment methods through mobile, first international conference of banks services marketing.


Noorani Kotenai, i.; Alizadeh Sani, m. (2008). Evaluate the role and influence of trust of customers in electronic banking", Second International Conference e-banking


Syyed javadin, s; yazdani, sh. (2005). study effective factors on customer used intention from internet banking services (case study: saman bank), Iranian journal of management knowledge, p47.

